

**REPORT  
OF THE EXTERNAL EVALUATION COMMISSION  
ON THE RESULTS OF COMPLIANCE ASSESSMENT  
OF THE STATE-OWNED MUNICIPAL ENTERPRISE ON THE REM  
"HIGHER MEDICAL COLLEGE" OF THE ALMATY PUBLIC HEALTH  
DEPARTMENT WITH THE STANDARDS FOR ACCREDITATION OF  
EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES IN MEDICAL AND  
PHARMACEUTICAL SPECIALTIES OF TECHNICAL AND  
VOCATIONAL EDUCATION**

**EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME IN  
0306000 "PHARMACY" (qualification in pharmacist)**

**1. Composition of the External Evaluation Commission**

In accordance with the ECAQA order No.27 dated 11.03.2019, the External Evaluation Commission (EEC) was formed to conduct specialized (programme) accreditation of the State-Owned Municipal Enterprise on the REM "Higher Medical College" of the Almaty Public Health Department with the following composition:

	<p><b>The Chairperson of the EEC</b> Gulmira Telmanovna Tokbergenova, Candidate of Pedagogic Sciences, Director of the Medical College "Interdent" phone: +77016557484 e-mail: tokbergenova@bk.ru</p>
	<p><b>Foreign Expert</b> Tamara Sultanovna Saktaganova, International Educational Holding "Gaudeamus", Member of the International Society of Honorary Nurses "Sigma Theta Tau", Honoured Health Worker of the Kyrgyz Republic phone: +77075144144 e-mail: tamarasaktanova@mail.ru</p>
	<p><b>National academic expert</b> Irina Vladimirovna Kadysheva, Deputy Director for training and production work, Higher Medical College of Astana Akimat phone: +77023498023 e-mail: kadisheva_irina@mail.ru</p>

	<p><b>National academic expert</b>  Elmira Amankulovna Kozhabayeva,  Director of the Abu Ali Ibn Sina Higher Medical  College LLP, Turkestan region, Saryagash  phone: +77017351385  e-mail: Avicenna.1999@mail.ru</p>
	<p><b>National academic expert</b>  Altynai Baltabayevna Kumarova,  Deputy Director for teaching and educational work of  the State-owned Municipal Enterprise on the Right of  Economic Management “Taldykorgan Higher Medical  College”  phone: +77058881798  e-mail: altynay_kumarova@mail.ru</p>
	<p><b>National academic expert</b>  Karlygash Amangeldiyevna Yestemesova,  Candidate of Biological Sciences, Associate Professor,  Dean of the School of Nursing Education, Karaganda  State Medical University  phone: +77784078721,  e-mail: Estemesova@kgmu.kz</p>
	<p><b>National academic expert</b>  Tatyana Kadyrovna Amanzholova,  Deputy Director for practical training of the non-state  educational institution “Kazakh-Russian Medical  College”  phone: +77017849893  e-mail: t.amanzholova@gmail.com</p>
	<p><b>Expert-trainee</b>  Diana Sergeyevna Bryuzgina,  4th-year-student in Nursing,  Republican Higher Medical College  phone: +77473124410  e-mail: didi_777@list.ru</p>

	<p><b>Expert-representative of Practical Health Care</b>  Zagira Alipbayevna Shukurgaliyeva,  Deputy Chief Physician for Nursing, State-owned  Municipal Enterprise on the Right of Economic  Management “City Cardiology Centre”, Almaty  phone: +77773854629  e-mail: zagira_57@mail.ru</p>
	<p><b>ECAQA Observer</b>  Makpal Aldibekovna Umarova,  Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality  Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care,  Head of the Accreditation and Monitoring Department  phone: +777475609212,  info@ecaqa.org</p>

During the period from March 27 to March 28, 2019, the assessment of compliance of the **educational programme in “Pharmacy” (qualification in pharmacist)** of the State-owned Municipal Enterprise on the REM "Higher Medical College" of the Almaty Public Health Department (hereinafter HMC) with the Standards for Accreditation of educational programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties of technical and vocational education was made.

The EEC report contains the assessment of the educational programme in "Pharmacy" of the State-owned Municipal Enterprise on the REM "Higher Medical College" of the Almaty Public Health Department for compliance with the ECAQA Standards for Accreditation, and the EEC recommendations on further improvement of the educational programme.

## **2. General Part of the EEC Final Report**

### **Presentation of the college and the educational programme in "Pharmacy" (qualification in pharmacist)**

The State-owned Municipal Enterprise on the REM "Higher Medical College" of the Almaty Public Health Department was founded in 1981 as the Almaty Medical Training School according to the Order No. 141 dated 12.03.1981 of the Ministry of Health of the Kazakh Soviet Socialist Republic "In order to improve the staffing level of health care facilities in Almaty through providing secondary health personnel."

The college has been training specialists in the state language since 1989. In 1992, the Training School was reorganized into the Almaty Medical College by the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 432 dated 03.09.1992. In 1993, the college cooperated with the University of Tucson (USA) to reform nursing. The college compiled a plan programme for four-level training

of nursing specialists: nursing assistant, nurse, specialized nurse, nurse manager of nursing.

In 1995, the college was defined as an experimental educational institution training nursing specialists in a multi-level system by the Decree of the Board of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The system of multi-level training of nursing specialists has been functioning at the college for more than 10 years (1995-2005).

The faculty of postgraduate continuing education was established in 2004, which was reorganized into the “Centre of Postgraduate Studies of Nursing Specialists” in 2007.

In 2015, the Health Department introduced new aspects of work for monitoring and auditing the nursing service of Almaty; in connection therewith the "Almaty Nursing Development Centre" was established on the basis of the Medical College.

By the resolution of the Akim (mayor) of Almaty No. 4/701 dated December 29, 2015, and the order of the Bostandyk District Department of Justice of the Almaty Department of Justice No. 2428 dated July 14, 2016, the “City Hospital of Nursing Care” was added to the college structure as its own clinical setting.

In 2016, the “Nursing Service Development Centre” was reorganized into the “Training Centre of the Almaty Public Health Department” by the Order of the Head of the Almaty Health Department.

In 2018, by the Resolution of the Almaty Akimat (local administration) dated June 6, 2018 No. 2/285, the college was renamed as the Higher Medical College of the Almaty Public Health Department.

The college activities are based on:

- The Charter of the State-owned Municipal Enterprise on the Right of Economic Management "Higher Medical College" of the Almaty Health Department, approved by the Decree of the Almaty Akimat (local administration) No. 2/285 dated June 6, 2018 and registered on 23.02.1999 with the Department of Justice of Almaty, with re-registration on 17.08.2018 (certificate No. 24550-1910-111);

- Certificates of State re-registration of a legal entity issued by the Department of Justice of the Medeuskiy District, the Department of Justice of Almaty dated 17.08.2018 BIN 990240002813;

The legal address of the college: Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty, Medeuskiy district, 12A Chaykinoy St., phone/fax +7 (727) 387-10-11, e-mail: info@medcollege.kz, the college website [www. www.medcollege.kz](http://www.medcollege.kz)

- Collective contract (protocol No. 2 dated 28.08.2018 of the labour collective meeting of the State-owned Municipal Enterprise on the REM "Higher Medical College") registered with the "State Labour and Migration Inspectorate Administration” Municipal Public Institution (reg. No. 40M dated 23.10.2018);

- “The Code of Business Ethics” of the “Higher Medical College” of the Almaty HD, approved by the director of the college (reg. No. 18 dated 31.08.2018).

Conclusions of the sanitary and epidemiological service and the Department of Emergency Services of Almaty on the use of the educational building are available.

The college trains specialists in 5 specialties in the state and Russian languages:

- 0301000 "Medical Care", qualifications in 0301013 "Physician Assistant", 0301023 "Obstetrician";
- 0302000 "Nursing", qualification in 0302033 "General Practice Nurse";
- 0305000 "Laboratory diagnostics", qualification in 0305013 "Medical Technologist";
- 0306000 "Pharmacy", qualification in 0306013 "Pharmacist". This programme has been implemented since 2015.
- 0302000 "Nursing", qualification in 0302054 "Applied Bachelor's Degree Programme".

The college is located in a standardized building; the total area of all the rooms used to organize the educational process is 5769.3 sq. m. The college has an assembly hall with 130 seats (an area of 405.8 sq. m.), a dining room with 85 seats and a buffet, a library (a subscription department and a reading room with 24 seats). Medical care for students is carried out at the first aid room. The college has 62 study rooms, a simulation centre, a centre for psychological relief and communication skills, a testing centre, and a sports hall.

The basis of the structural organization of the college is made up of the Cycle Methodological Commissions, the Training Centre, and the Hospital for Nursing Care.

The internal management of the college is carried out according to the annually approved plan of the QMS (quality management system) in accordance with the current staffing. The college management is carried out by the director. The college belongs to the healthcare system and is under the hierarchical powers of the Almaty Public Health Department.

The college has a state-owned property on the right of economic management. The functions of the subject of communal property law in relation to the HMC are performed by the Almaty Akimat. The number of students for the 2018-2019 academic year is 1385, of which 1054 students are trained in the state language of instruction. 243 people are at the budget department, 222 of them are taught in the state language of instruction. The fee paid department has 340 people, of which 249 are trained in the state language of instruction.

Currently, the cohort for the educational programme in "Pharmacy" is 31. 3 graduations were carried out and 55 specialists with qualification in "Pharmacist" were trained in "Pharmacy".

In the academic year 2018-2019, the total number of educators was 130 including 111 full-time educators and 19 part-timers. Out of the total number of educators, 31 have the highest qualification category, 11 possess the first qualification category, and 33 have the second qualification category.

In 2017-2018 and 2018-2019 academic years, implementation of the educational programme in "Pharmacy" is provided by 22 educators, including 20

(91%) full-time educators, 2 (9%) part-time educators. Among them there are 22 academically trained educators (100%), 1 candidate of science (4.5%), 4 masters (18%), including masters of medical, educational and social sciences, 11 educators with highest qualification category (50%), 3 educators with the first qualification category (13.6%), 4 educators with the second qualification category (18.2%), and 4 educators without category (18.2% ).

In recent years, the college funding has been stable and has contributed to improving the material and technical base and increasing the number of students.

### **3. Analysis of compliance of the educational programme in "Pharmacy" with the Standards for Accreditation, and the review of strengths in each standard**

#### **STANDARD 1: Mission and Outcomes**

The external experts obtained evidence that the mission of the college meets the objectives of the country's development, the national system of technical and vocational education, the health care system and the development of human resources in pharmacy. During interviews with students, educators, managers and employers, concern of staff members, employees, the student community and pharmacists in the discussion of the mission and goals was established. The development and approval of the mission and vision took place in accordance with the existing procedure that ensures the involvement of all stakeholders, both at the planning stage and in the implementation of decisions made. An individual mission of the educational programme is not available.

Student-centered and practice-oriented training of future pharmacists with secondary specialized education ensures the implementation of the learning outcomes, a list of which is included in the working training programmes. Pharmacy students are adherents of their college and are informed about the organization's mission via the college website, information stands and communication with teachers. All Pharmacy students are aware of the qualification requirements of the specialty from the first lesson and strive to achieve the learning outcomes of training. There are no underachievers in this specialty.

#### ***The strengths of the standard:***

- Clearly formulated mission, goals and objectives;
- International quality management system ISO 9001:2016 (ISO: 2015);
- Strategic Plan with the main aspects of the college educational activities;
- Wide representation of college educators and consumers of the educational process, practical health care and pharmacy, students, parents in the adoption of the plan based on transparency and openly accessible academic policy of the college;
- Active and mutually beneficial integration with practical health care and pharmacy;
- Various types of learning outcomes.

***The EEC conclusions on the criteria (see Annex 1):*** comply - 9, partially comply - 0, do not comply - 0.

**Standard 1:** accomplished

**Recommendations:** none

## **STANDARD 2: Educational programme**

The educational programme in "Pharmacy" is implemented in accordance with the mission, goals and expected learning outcomes and reflects the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the needs and expectations of practical pharmacy and society as a whole. The methods used, the forms of teaching and learning, as well as the content of this educational programme are based on modern principles, the participation of stakeholders from medical universities, contribute to the formation of professional competencies and determine the content, volume and sequence of training components.

The EEC received compelling data on the methodological support of the educational programme, the use of various teaching methods by educators (traditional and interactive). During students questioning, a high percentage of student satisfaction with the college education was established. Pharmacy students participate in research and speak at conferences. A high percentage of employment over the past three years (96%) has been noted in this specialty in particular.

### ***The strengths of the standard:***

- Good material and technical base consistent with the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan and SanRaN and qualified teaching staff;

- The educational programme in "Pharmacy" is developed in accordance with the mission, goals and expected cumulative results of students, and reflects professional standards of technical and vocational education after secondary education in medical and pharmaceutical specialties;

- Presence of mutually beneficial agreements (contracts) on cooperation between the college and practical health care;

- Interest of university and practical pharmacy in the training of qualified personnel;

- Active use of information and innovative pedagogical technologies and principles of a scientific approach developing communicative abilities and analytical, critical thinking of students;

- "Pharmacy" graduates are employed at pharmaceutical organizations of the city, province and other regions. The quality of college education allows graduates to continue their studies at universities.

***The EEC conclusions on the criteria:*** comply - 12, partially comply - 2, do not comply - 0.

**Standard 2:** accomplished

### ***Recommendations for improvement:***

1. To enhance students' research work (in all educational programmes).
2. To continue implementing dual education system.
3. To replenish the educational programme with educational materials.



### **STANDARD 3: Assessment**

The HMC principles, methods and practice of assessing students' professional competencies guarantee openness and accessibility, ensure that students achieve the learning outcomes and are comparable to the teaching methodology. During the visit to practical classes, the EEC experts established the real application of different methods for assessing students (oral enquiry, written assignments, testing, interactive quizzes, problem solving, etc.). During the interview with students, the experts found that more than 90% of students recognize the fairness and objectivity of methods for assessing their knowledge and skills.

#### ***The strengths of the standard:***

- The assessment methods used at the college are reliable and valid;
- A unified automated system for monitoring students' knowledge;
- Monitoring the level of professional qualifications of students at various levels of the educational process;
- Good rates of demand and employment of college graduates.

***The EEC conclusions on the criteria:*** comply - 5, partially comply - 0, do not comply - 0.

***Standard 3:*** accomplished

***Recommendations for improvement:*** none.

### **STANDARD 4: Students**

The Higher Medical College pursues an academic policy of tolerance: openness, transparency and accessibility, both at the admission stage and throughout the entire period of study. Information on academic policy is annually updated, published on the website and is publicly available.

The EEC experts examined evidence on the effectiveness of the policy of attracting, admitting and screening students. At the same time, during the analysis of the self-evaluation report and the visit to the college, the EEC found that there was an insufficient quantity of students in the specialty (31).

The HMC implements educational and methodical and social support for students; student life is rich and diverse. At the same time, during the interview, "Pharmacy" students showed greater passivity as compared with "Medical Care" students.

#### ***The strengths of the standard:***

- The policy and criteria for admission to the college are objective, transparent and public;
- An effective student support service;
- Application and use of modern educational technologies, including information ones;
- Good conditions for creativity and personal growth of students;
- Stable results of academic performance and quality of students' knowledge.

***The EEC conclusions on the criteria:*** comply - 12, partially comply - 0, do not comply - 0.

***Standard 4:*** accomplished



***Recommendations for improvement:***

1. To enhance career guidance work on attracting applicants to the "Pharmacy" specialty.

**STANDARD 5: Academic Staff/Faculty**

The educational programme is sufficiently provided with qualified teaching staff. The college human resources possess modern pedagogical technologies and methods, organize a sociocultural and health-saving environment, create the conditions necessary for the comprehensive development and socialization of student personality, contribute to the development of the educational component of the educational process, broadcast best practices, actively and creatively interact with students, which makes it possible to effectively implement vocational education programs according to the requirements of the Qualification Profile of Educators and the requirements for licensing of educational activities.

***The strengths of the standard:***

- повышение квалификации преподавателей и сотрудников колледжа;
- A system for selection and placement of teaching staff in accordance with regulatory documents on personnel management procedures;
- Conditions for a positive personal growth of educators and opportunities for the full disclosure of the potential for personal contribution to the sustainable development of the college;
- An effective system of material and moral incentives for educators and staff;
- Active participation of college educators and involvement of medical university staff in the development and publication;
- Continuous professional development of educators and college staff.

***The EEC conclusions on the criteria:*** comply - 4, partially comply - 0, do not comply - 0.

***Standard 5:*** accomplished

***Recommendations for improvement:*** none

**STANDARD 6: Educational resources**

The HMC has a well-developed material and technical base equipped with a fund of educational, methodical, scientific literature on paper and electronic media, training equipment, auxiliary technical means and information and communication technologies. The college conducts systematic work on the development, updating and replenishment of material and technical equipment for the educational programme and the introduction of new information and communication technologies in the educational process in "Pharmacy". The college periodically conducts training of educators with the involvement of local and foreign experts.

***The strengths of the standard:***

- Good material and technical base and qualified teaching staff corresponding to the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan and SanRaN;
- High assortment and selection of material, technical, information, library resources, including those in "Pharmacy";
- Constant updating of the material and technical base, including the 6th agreement with the practice bases in "Pharmacy", taking into account the relevance and reform of the healthcare system of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

*The EEC conclusions on the criteria:* comply - 9, partially comply - 2, do not comply - 0.

**Standard 6:** accomplished

**Recommendations for improvement:**

1. To update and supplement the college library fund in "Pharmacy";
2. To develop information resources in the educational process of the college (interactive whiteboards, computer programmes in "Pharmacy").

### **STANDARD 7: Programme Evaluation**

The college has an effective monitoring system for educational programme evaluation focused on students' satisfaction with their educational level. The college systematically collects, analyzes, corrects and supplements the feedback results of educators and students regarding the stated mission, goals, objectives and strategic plan.

**The strengths of the standard:**

- Systematic studies of the expectations and satisfaction of educators, staff, students, employers;
- High percentage of satisfaction of educators, employees, students, employers with work conditions at the college.

*The EEC conclusions on the criteria:* comply - 9, partially comply - 0, do not comply - 0.

**Standard 7:** accomplished

**Recommendations for improvement:**

1. To improve the assessment of the educational programme in "Pharmacy", taking into account the requirements of employers and public needs.

### **STANDARD 8. Governance and administration**

The college governance has a sufficient level of managerial competence, takes responsibility for the implementation of all processes that ensure the achievement of the mission. The organizational structure has a person in charge of the management of the "Pharmacy" educational programme, namely, the Head of the Department of "General Medicine, Pharmacy, and Laboratory Diagnostics". The governance system and its activities are open, transparent and accessible. In 2014, the college passed a scheduled state attestation in 4 specialties including "Pharmacy" (the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 700 dated 21.10.2014 "On the results of state attestation of the medical college

of the Almaty Health Department.” The college management is ready and able to change, all of which together ensures the effectiveness of management activities.

***The strengths of the standard:***

- Interest of practical pharmacy and the city healthcare department in training of qualified pharmacy personnel;

- The international quality management system ISO 9001:2016 (ISO: 2015) has been introduced.

***The EEC conclusions on the criteria:*** comply - 9, partially comply - 0, do not comply - 0.

***Standard 8:*** accomplished

***Recommendations for improvement:***

1. To develop international cooperation.

### **STANDARD 9. Continuous renewal**

The system of continuous renewal of all key areas of activity, especially educational one, is well established and implemented at the HMC. All goals and objectives, as well as improvement measures, are included in the College’s Strategic Plan 2023. The college constantly reviews its organizational and staff structure, updates the goals and functions of the strategic plan, regulatory documents taking into account the needs of healthcare and society, modernizes the material and technical base, improves modern educational technologies and innovations in the learning process to implement the institutional goals and objectives of the college, the needs of students and practical health care.

***The strengths of the standard:***

- Creation of Centre of psychological relief and communication skills;

- Graduate knowledge evaluation forms introduced on the basis of international practice, development of skills on simulation equipment, determination of the students’ level of knowledge using OSCE

- Availability of elective disciplines;

- Planned training of educators and administrative workers in the country and abroad.

***The EEC conclusions on the criteria:*** comply - 7, partially comply - 0, do not comply - 0.

***Standard 9:*** accomplished

Thus, as a result of the analysis of the criteria for the compliance of the educational programme in “Pharmacy” with accreditation standards, full compliance with 76 criteria and partial compliance with 4 criteria was established. Inconsistencies with accreditation standards were not defined.

### **3. Recommendations for improvement of the educational programme in "Pharmacy"**

1. To continue updating the college material and technical base.

2. To replenish the educational programme with educational materials.

3. To supplement the college library with modern educational literature in “Pharmacy”, including literature in the state language.
4. To develop international cooperation in pharmacy.
5. To enhance students’ research work in "Pharmacy" resulting in publications and presentations.
6. To develop information resources, including introduction of computer programmes in the educational process in “Pharmacy”.
7. To continue implementing dual education system.
8. To improve the assessment of the educational programme, taking into account the requirements of employers and public needs.

### Рекомендация Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА

Члены ВЭК пришли к единогласному мнению рекомендовать Аккредитационному совету аккредитовать образовательную программу по специальности **0306000 «Фармация» квалификация 0306013 «Фармацевт»** КГП на ПХВ «Высший медицинский колледж» Управления общественного здоровья города Алматы на период 5 лет.

Председатель ВЭК	Токбергенова Гульмира Тельмановна	
Зарубежный эксперт	Сактанова Тамара Султановна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Кадышева Ирина Владимировна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Кожабаяева Эльмира Аманкуловна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Кумарова Алтынай Балтабаевна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Естемесова Карлыгаш Амангельдиевна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Аманжолова Татьяна Кадыровна	
Эксперт – работодатель	Шукурғалиева Загира Алипбаевна	
Эксперт – слушатель	Брюзгина Диана Сергеевна	
Наблюдатель ВЭК	Умарова Макпал Альдибековна	

Национальный академический эксперт	Естемесова К Амангельдие
Национальный академический эксперт	Аманжолова
Эксперт – работодатель	Шукурғалиев Алипбаевна
Эксперт – слушатель	Брюзгина Ди
Наблюдатель ВЭК	Умарова Мак

**Quality profile and external evaluation criteria according to the Standards for accreditation of educational programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties of technical and vocational education of the State-Owned Municipal Enterprise on the REM "Higher Medical College" of the Almaty Public Health Department**

**on the educational programme in "Pharmacy"**

<b>Standard</b>	<b>Criteria for assessment</b>	<b>Assessment</b>		
		<b>Comply</b>	<b>Partially comply</b>	<b>Do not comply</b>
<b>1.</b>	<b>Mission and Outcomes</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>2.</b>	<b>Educational programme</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>3.</b>	<b>Assessment</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>4.</b>	<b>Students</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>5.</b>	<b>Academic Staff/Faculty</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>6.</b>	<b>Educational resources</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>7.</b>	<b>Programme Evaluation</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>8.</b>	<b>Governance and administration</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>9.</b>	<b>Continuous renewal</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
	<b>Total</b>	<b>76</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>0</b>